

COURT OF APPEAL FOR ONTARIO

BETWEEN:

ARNOLD MINORS

**Appellant
(Plaintiff)**

- and -

**THE TORONTO SUN PUBLISHING CORPORATION,
HARTLEY STEWARD, JOHN DOWNING, CHRISTIE BLATCHFORD,
JAMES WALLACE, JEFF HARDER, ROBERT BENZIE,
TRACY NESDOLY and ANDY DONATO**

**Respondents
(Defendants)**

**BOOK OF AUTHORITIES OF THE RESPONDENTS
(VOLUME III)**

GOODMAN PHILLIPS & VINEBERG
Barristers & Solicitors
250 Yonge Street
Suite 2400
Toronto, Ontario
M5B 2M6

**Joe Conforti
Graham Smith
Carolyn Silver**
Tel: (416) 979-2211
Fax: (416) 979-1234

Solicitors for the Respondents

INDEX

Tab

VOLUME I

1. *Gatley on Libel and Slander*, 9th Ed., paras. 1.7, 11.1, 11.7, 12.1, 12.6-12.7, 12.21, 12.22, 12.24, 12.25, 12.29-12.30, 14.5, 14.89, 16.4, 16.13, 16.15, 18.17, 32.27
2. C.E.D. (Ontario), 3rd Ed., Vol. 8A, "Defamation", paras. 119-30, 121, 125, 169, 173, 354
3. *Patterson v. Plaindealer Co.* (1909), 2 Alta. L.R. (T.D.)
4. *Cookson v. Harewood*, [1932] 2 K.B. 482n. (C.A.)
5. *Astaire v. Campling*, [1966] 1 W.L.R. 34 (C.A.)
6. Porter and Potts, *Canadian Libel Practice*, para. 462
7. *Turner v. Toronto Sun* (1990), 50 C.P.C. (2d) 73 (Ont. Gen. Div.)
8. *Pizza Pizza Limited v. Toronto Star Newspapers Ltd.* (1998), 42 O.R. (3d) 36 (Ont. Gen. Div.)
9. *Baumann v. Turner* (1993), 105 D.L.R. (4th) 37 (B.C.C.A.)
10. Brown, *The Law of Defamation in Canada*, 2d Ed., pp. 5-93, 15-46, 15-47, 22-52, 24-2, 24-3, 24-4, 24-7, 24-9, 24-12.1, 27-132 ff.
11. *Silkin v. Beaverbrook Newspapers Ltd.*, [1958] 1 W.L.R. 743 (Q.B.)
12. *Halsbury's Laws of England*, 4th Ed., Vol. 28, "Libel and Slander", para. 89
13. *Kemsley v. Foot*, [1951] 1 All E.R. 331 (C.A.)
14. *Holt v. Sun Publishing Co. Ltd.* (1979), 100 D.L.R. (3d) 447 (B.C.C.A.)
15. *Horrocks v. Lowe*, [1975] A.C. 135 (H.L.)
16. *Renouf v. Federal Capital Press* (1977), 17 A.C.T.R. 35 (S.C.)
17. *Egger v. Viscount Chelmsford et al.*, [1965] 1 Q.B. 248
18. *Slim v. Daily Telegraph, Ltd.*, [1968] 1 All E.R. 497 (C.A.)
19. *Hallren v. Holden* (1914), 7 W.W.R. 462 (B.C.C.A.)
20. *Turner v. MGM Pictures, Ltd.*, [1950] 1 All E.R. 499 (H.L.)

Tab

VOLUME II

21. C.E.D. (Ontario), 3rd Ed., Vol. 11, "*Evidence*", paras. 157, 163
22. *Draper v. Jacklyn*, [1970] S.C.R. 92
23. *Pietkiewitz v. Sault Ste. Marie District Roman Catholic Separate School Board*, [1999] O.J. No. 107 (Gen. Div.)
24. *Vander Zalm v. Times Publishers, Bierman, McLintock and Underhill*, [1980] 4 W.W.R. 259 (B.C.C.A.)
25. *Hill v. Church of Scientology of Toronto*, [1995] 2 S.C.R. 1130
26. Thomson and McCloskey, "Libel and Slander", in *Law Society of Upper Canada Special Lectures* (1983)
27. *Stopforth v. Goyer* (1979), 23 O.R. (2d) 696 (C.A.)
28. *Parlett v. Robinson* (1986), 30 D.L.R. (4th) 247 (B.C.C.A.)
29. *Loos v. Robbins* (1987), 37 D.L.R. (4th) 418 (Sask. C.A.)
30. *Silva v. Toronto Star Newspapers Ltd.* (1998), 167 D.L.R. (4th) 554 (Ont. Gen. Div.)
31. *Grenier v. Southam Inc.*, (unreported) (Ont. Gen. Div.), affirmed [1997] O.J. No. 2193 (C.A.)
32. *Parsons v. Windsor Star* (1989), 71 O.R. (2d) 5 (H.C.J.)
33. *Camporese v. Parton* (1983), 150 D.L.R. (3d) 208 (B.C.S.C.)
34. *Edwards v. National Audubon Society Inc.*, 556 F.2d 113 (1977, 2d Cir.)
35. *Reynolds v. Times Newspapers Ltd.*, [1998] 3 All E.R. 961 (C.A.)

VOLUME III

36. *Theophanous v. Herald & Weekly Times Ltd.* (1994), 124 A.L.R. 1 (H.C.A.)
37. *Lange v. Australian Broadcasting Corporation* (1997), 145 A.L.R. 96 (H.C.A.)
38. *Lange v. Atkinson*, [1998] 3 N.Z.L.R. 424 (C.A.)
39. *Bogoshi v. National Media Ltd.*, [1998] S.A.J. No. 25 (S.Af.S.C.A.)
40. *Reference Re: Alberta Legislation*, [1938] S.C.R. 100
41. *Edmonton Journal v. Alberta (Attorney-General)*, [1989] 2 S.C.R. 1326

Tab

42. *Schwartz v. Canada* (1996), 133 D.L.R. (4th) 289 (S.C.C.)
43. *Kelly v. Journal Printing Co. of Ottawa* (1905), 5 O.W.R. 83 (C.A.)

G25/SILVERC332843

COURT OF APPEAL FOR ONTARIO

BETWEEN:

ARNOLD MINORS

Plaintiff
(Appellant)

- and -

THE TORONTO SUN PUBLISHING CORPORATION, HARTLEY STEWARD, JOHN
DOWNING, CHRISTIE BLATCHFORD, JAMES WALLACE,
JEFF HARDER, ROBERT BENZIE, TRACY NESDOLY,
ANDY DONATO and ERIC

Defendants
(Respondents)

**CASE BOOK OF THE APPELLANT
VOLUME I**

ILER, CAMPBELL, KLIPPENSTEIN
Barristers & Solicitors
160 John Street, 2nd Floor
Toronto, Ontario
M5V 2E5

(416) 598-0103
(416) 598-3484
Charles Campbell
Solicitor for the Plaintiff

Original

CASEBOOK INDEX

	Tab No.
Defamatory meaning	
<i>Lewis v. Daily Telegraph Ltd.</i> , [1964] A.C. 234 (H.L.)	1
<i>Hodgson v. Canadian Newspapers Co.</i> (1998), 30 O.R. (3d) 235 (Gen. Div.)	2
<i>Thomas v. C.B.C.</i> , [1981] 4 W.W.R. 289 (N.W.T.S.C.)	3
Brown, <i>The Law of Defamation in Canada</i> (2d ed), pp. 5-12 to 5-22	4
<i>Berkoff v. Burchill</i> , [1996] 4 All E.R. 1008 (C.A.)	5
<i>Ward v. McBride</i> (1911), 24 O.L.R. 555 (C.A.)	6
<i>Masson v. New Yorker Magazine Inc.</i> , 111 S.Ct. 2419 (1991)	7
<i>Memphis Publishing Co. v. Nichols</i> , 569 S.W.2d 412 (Tenn. 1978)	8
 Distinguishing fact and comment	
Brown, <i>The Law of Defamation in Canada</i> (2d ed), pp. 15-12 to 15-22	(See Tab 4)
<i>Gatley on Libel & Slander</i> , 9 th ed., 1998, paras. 12.10 and 12.11	9
<i>Kemsley v. Foot</i> , [1952] A.C. 345 (H.L.)	10
<i>Jones v. Bennett</i> (1967), 59 W.W.R. 449 (B.C.S.C.), aff'd [1969] S.C.R. 277	11
<i>Kenney v. McLaughlin</i> , 71 Mass. (5 Gray) 3 (1855)	12
Brown, <i>The Law of Defamation in Canada</i> (2d ed), at p. 7-24	13
<i>Leech v. Leader Publishing Co.</i> (1926), 20 Sask L.R. 337 (C.A.)	14
<i>Boys v. Star Printing and Publishing Co.</i> (1927), 60 O.L.R. 592 (C.A.)	15
 The defence of justification	
<i>Price v. Chicoutimi Pulp Co.</i> , [1915] 51 S.C.R. 179	16
<i>Boys v. Star Printing and Publishing Co.</i>	(See Tab 15)
<i>Peddie v. Kerr</i> [1996] O.J. No. 2551 (Gen. Div.) (QL)	17
<i>London Artists v. Littler</i> , [1969] Q.B. 375 (C.A.)	18

<i>Bank of British Columbia v. C.B.C.</i> (1995), 40 C.P.C. (3d) 353 (B.C.C.A.)	19
<i>Sutherland v. Stopes</i> , [1925] A.C. 47 (H.L.)	20
<i>Leonard v. Wharton</i> (1921), 65 D.L.R. 323 (S.C.C.)	21
<i>Dunlap v. Philadelphia Newspapers Inc.</i> , 448 A.2d 6 (1982)	22
Brown, <i>The Law of Defamation in Canada</i> (2d ed), pp. 10-16 to 10-22.3	23

The defence of fair comment

<i>Hodgson v. Canadian Newspapers Co.</i>	(See Tab 2)
<i>Gatley on Libel & Slander</i> , 9 th ed., 1998, para. 12.21	24

(a) comment must be based on facts truly, clearly, and sufficiently stated

<i>Kemsley v. Foot</i>	(See Tab 10)
<i>London Artists v. Littler</i>	(See Tab 18)
<i>Kerr v. Conlogue</i> (1992), 65 B.C.L.R. (2d) 70 (S.C.)	25
Brown, <i>The Law of Defamation in Canada</i> (2d ed), pp. 15-32 to 15-39	26
<i>Price v. Chicoutimi Pulp Co.</i>	(See Tab 16)
<i>Conmee v. Lake Superior Printing Co.</i> (1903), 2 O.W.R. 543	27
<i>Holt v. Sun Publishing Co. Ltd.</i> (1980), 100 D.L.R. (3d) 447 (B.C.C.A.)	28
<i>Jeyaretnam v. Tong</i> (1989), 109 N.R. 15 (P.C.)	29
<i>Telnikoff v. Matusevitch</i> , [1990] 3 W.L.R. 725 (C.A.), rev'd in part on other grounds [1991] 3 W.L.R. 953 (H.L.) 952	30
<i>England v. CBC</i> , [1979] 3 W.W.R. 193 (N.W.T.S.C.)	31
<i>Thomas v. CBC</i> , [1981] 4 W.W.R. 289 (N.W.T.S.C.)	(See Tab 3)
<i>Renouf v. Federal Capital Press</i> (1977), 17 A.C.T.R. 35 (S.C.)	32
<i>Cohen v. Daily Telegraph Ltd.</i> , [1968] 2 All E.R. 407 (C.A.)	33

<i>Wheatley v. Anderson</i> , 1927 S.C. 133 (Ct. of Sess.)	34
<i>Australian Ocean Line Pty. Ltd. v. West Australian Newspapers Ltd.</i> (1985), 58 A.L.R. 439	35
<i>Gatley on Libel & Slander</i> , 9 th ed., 1998, para. 12.13	36

(b) fairness of comment

(i) defending one's own comment

<i>Bains v. Indo-Canadian Times</i> (1995), 38 C.P.C. (3d) 53 (B.C.C.A.)	37
<i>Kerr v. Conlogue</i> (1992)	(See Tab 25)
<i>A.U.P.E. v. Edmonton Sun</i> (1986), 39 C.C.L.T. 143 (Alta. Q.B.)	38
<i>Campbell v. Spottiswoode</i> (1863), 122 E.R. 288	39
<i>Jeyaretnam v. Tong</i> (1989)	(See Tab 29)
<i>Hodgson v. Canadian Newspapers Co.</i>	(See Tab 2)
<i>Christie v. Geiger</i> (1986), [1987] 1 W.W.R. 357 (Alta. C.A.)	40
<i>Duncan and Neill on Defamation</i> (2d ed, 1983)	41
<i>Telnikoff v. Matusevitch</i> , [1991] 3 W.L.R. 953 (H.L.) 952	42
<i>Hedley v. Barlow</i> (1865), 176 E.R. 541	43
<i>London Artists v. Littler</i>	(See Tab 18)
<i>Renouf v. Federal Capital Press</i>	(See Tab 32)
<i>Dakhyl v. Labouchere</i> , [1908] 2 K.B. 325 (H.L.)	44
<i>Christie v. Geiger & Edmonton Sun</i> (1984), 35 Alta. L.R. (2d) 316 (Q.B.), affirmed (1986), [1987] 1 W.W.R. 357 at 362 (C.A.)	45

(ii) defending comment by another person

<i>Libel and Slander Act</i> , R.S.O. 1990, c. L.12, s. 24	46
<i>Hodgson v. Canadian Newspapers Co.</i>	(See Tab 2)

Higher test for "fairness" when imputing improper or dishonourable motives

<i>Campbell v. Spottiswoode</i> (1863)	(See Tab 39)
<i>Hodgson v. Canadian Newspapers Co.</i>	(See Tab 2)
<i>Hunt v Star Newspaper Co. Ltd.</i> , [1908] 2 K.B. 309 (C.A.)	47
<i>Dakhyl v. Labouchere</i>	(See Tab 44)
<i>Masters v. Fox</i> (1978), 85 D.L.R. (3d) 64 (B.C.S.C.)	48
<i>Joynt v. Cycle Trade Publishing Co.</i> , [1904] 2 K.B. 292 (C.A.), cited with approval in <i>Doyle v. Sparrow</i> (1979), 27 O.R. (2d) 206 (C.A.), leave to appeal ref'd (1980), 27 O.R. (2d) 206n (S.C.C.)	49

Appellate review of findings of fact

<i>Beaudoin-Daigneault v. Richard</i> , [1984] 1 S.C.R. 2	50
<i>Fletcher v. Manitoba Public Insurance Co.</i> , [1990] 3 S.C.R. 191	51
<i>Jengle v. Keetch</i> (1992), 7 O.R. (3d) 187 (C.A.)	52

Evidence relevant to malice

<i>Jerome v. Anderson</i> (1964), 44 D.L.R. (2d) 516 (S.C.C.)	53
<i>Timmons v. National Life Assur. Co.</i> (1909), 19 Man. L.R. 227 (C.A.)	54
<i>A.T.U. v. I.C.T.U.</i> , [1997] 5 W.W.R. 662 (Alta. Q.B.)	55
<i>Teskey v. Canadian Newspapers Co.</i> (1989), 68 O.R. (2d) 737 (C.A.) leave to appeal to S.C.C. refused (1990), 37 O.A.C. 396 (note) (S.C.C.)	56
<i>Boushy v. Sarnia Gazette</i> (1980), 30 O.R. (2d) 667 (H.C.)	57
<i>Nolan v. Tipping</i> (1858), 7 U.C.C.P. 524 (C.A.)	58
<i>Pearson v. Lemaitre</i> (1843), 134 E.R. 742	59
<i>Renouf v. Federal Capital Press</i> (1977)	(See Tab 32)
<i>Hill v. Church of Scientology</i> (1995), 30 C.R.R. (2d) 189 (S.C.C.)	60

<i>Sun Life Assurance Co. of Canada v. Dalrymple</i> , [1965] S.C.R. 302	61
<i>Wlodek v. Kosko</i> (1974), 7 O.R. 611 (C.A.)	62
<i>Paletta v. Lethbridge Herald Co. (No. 2)</i> (1976), 4 Alta. L.R. 97 (S.C.)	63
<i>Pearson v. Harris</i> , [1937] 3 W.W.R. 602 (B.C.S.C.)	64
<i>Royal Aquarium and Summer and Winter Garden Society Ltd. v. Parkinson</i> [1892], 1 Q.B. 431	65
<i>Brown v. P.N. Hirsch & Company Stores Inc.</i> , 661 S.W.2d 587 (Mo. App. 1983)	66
<i>Toney v. State</i> , 126 Cal. Rptr. 869 (Cal. App. 5 Dist. 1976)	67
<i>Hodgson v. Canadian Newspapers Co.</i> , <i>supra</i> , at Tab	(See Tab 2)
<i>Vogel v. C.B.C.</i> , [1982] 3 W.W.R. 97 (B.C.S.C.)	68
<i>Australian Broadcasting Corp. v. Comalco</i> (1986), 68 Aust. L.R. 259 (F.C.)	69
<i>Lionel Barber & Co. v. Deutsche Bank London Agency</i> , [1919] A.C. 304 (H.L.)	70
<i>Turnbull v. Bird</i> (1861), 175 E.R. 1163	71
 Definition of malice	
<i>Hill v. Church of Scientology</i>	(See Tab 60)
<i>Botiuk v. Toronto Free Press</i> , [1995] 3 S.C.R. 3	72
<i>Hodgson v. Canadian Newspapers Co.</i>	(See Tab 2)
<i>Gatley on Libel & Slander</i> , 9 th ed., 1998, para. 16.2	73
<i>Boland v. Globe & Mail Ltd.</i> , [1961] O.R. 712 (C.A.)	74
<i>Maidman v. Jewish Publications Inc.</i> , 355 P. 2d 265 (1960)	75
<i>Thomas v. Bradbury, Agnew & Co.</i> , [1906] 2 K.B. 627 (C.A.)	76
<i>Renouf v. Federal Capital Press</i> (1977)	(See Tab 32)
<i>Winnipeg Steel Granary & Culvert Inc. v. Canada Ingot Iron Culvert Co.</i> (1912), 22 Man. R. 576 (C.A.)	77
Brown, <i>The Law of Defamation in Canada</i> (2d ed), pp. 16-33 to 16-37	78

<i>A.T.U. v. I.C.T.U.</i>	(See Tab 55)
<i>Moss v. Stockard</i> , 580 A.2d 1011 (D.C. App. 1990)	79
<i>Platt v. Time International of Canada Ltd.</i> , [1964] 2 O.R. 21 (H.C.J.)	80
<i>Pearson v. Harris</i>	(See Tab 64)
<i>Teskey v. Canadian Newspapers Co.</i> , <i>supra</i> , at Tab	(See Tab 56)
<i>Coates v. The Citizen</i> (1988), 44 C.C.L.T. 286 (N.S.S.C.)	81
<i>Westbank Indians v. Tomat</i> (1992), 88 D.L.R. (4th) 401 (B.C.C.A.)	82

Malice and Charter values

<i>Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms</i> , ss. 1, 2(b), 15, and 27	83
<i>Hill v. Church of Scientology</i>	(See Tab 60)
<i>R. v. Keegstra</i> (1990), 3 C.R.R. (2d) 193 at (S.C.C.)	84
<i>Taylor v. Canadian Human Rights Commission</i> (1990), 75 D.L.R. (4th) 577 (S.C.C.)	85
<i>Moises v. Canadian Newspaper Co.</i> (1996), 30 C.C.L.T. (2d) 145 (B.C.C.A.)	86
<i>R. v. Parks</i> (1993), 15 O.R. (3d) 324 at (C.A.)	87
<i>R. v. Williams</i> , [1998] S.C.J. No. 49 (QL)	88
<i>Ontario Human Rights Commission v. Simpsons-Sears</i> (1985), 23 D.L.R. (4th) 321 (S.C.C.)	89
<i>Saskatchewan (Human Rights Commission) v. Bell</i> (1994), 114 D.L.R. (4th) 370 (Sask. C.A.)	90

Liability of corporate publisher

<i>Munro v. Toronto Sun Pub. Corp.</i> (1982), 39 O.R. (2d) 100 (H.C.)	91
Brown, <i>The Law of Defamation in Canada</i> (2d ed), pp. 7-7 to 7-10, 7-23 to 7-26, and 18-29 to 18-40	92
<i>Botiuk v. Toronto Free Press</i>	(See Tab 72)

Sun Life Assurance Co. of Canada v. Dalrymple

(See Tab 61)

Hill v. Church of Scientology

(See Tab 60)

Timmons v. National Life Assur. Co. (1909), 19 Man. R. 227 (C.A.)

(See Tab 54)

W:\WPFILES\I-MMINORS\APPEAL\CASBKIND.WPD

COURT OF APPEAL FOR ONTARIO

BETWEEN:

ARNOLD MINORS

**Appellant
(Plaintiff)**

- and -

**THE TORONTO SUN PUBLISHING CORPORATION,
HARTLEY STEWARD, JOHN DOWNING, CHRISTIE BLATCHFORD,
JAMES WALLACE, JEFF HARDER, ROBERT BENZIE,
TRACY NESDOLY and ANDY DONATO**

**Respondents
(Defendants)**

**SUPPLEMENTAL
BOOK OF AUTHORITIES OF THE RESPONDENTS**

GOODMAN PHILLIPS & VINEBERG

Barristers & Solicitors
250 Yonge Street
Suite 2400
Toronto, Ontario
M5B 2M6

**Joe Conforti
Graham Smith
Carolyn Silver**

**Tel: (416) 979-2211
Fax: (416) 979-1234**

Solicitors for the Respondents

INDEX

Tab

1. *Halsbury's Laws of England*, 4th Ed., Vol. 28 (Reissue), "Libel & Slander", para. 84
2. *Gatley on Libel and Slander*, 9th Ed., paras. 11.2, 27.7, 27.8 and 27.9
3. *Polly Peck (Holdings) plc v. Trelford*, [1986] 2 All E.R. 84 (C.A.)
4. *Prager v. Times Newspapers Ltd.*, [1988] 1 W.L.R. 77 (C.A.)